# Future Beneficiary Expectations of the Returns to Delayed Social Security Benefit Claiming and Choice Behavior 

Jeff [Dominitz<br>Angela Hung<br>Arthur Van Soest

Prepared for the 9th Annual Joint Conference of the Retirement Research Consortium
"Challenges and Solutions for Retirement Security"
August 9-10, 2007
Washington, D.C.

## Delaying claim of Social Security benefits

- Choice of initial claiming age for Social Security retirement benefits is analogous to the decision to purchase annuities
- A 62 y.o. retiree can implicitly purchase 7\% more in SS payments by the expenditure of one year of SS benefits.
- If claim immediately, monthly benefit is 75\% of PIA
- If delay claiming for one year, the monthly benefit will be $\mathbf{8 0 \%}$ of the PIA.
- Previous work has found low rates of delayed claiming (Coile et al., 2002, and Hurd et al., 2004)


## Sample Statement Page 2

## Your Estimated Benefits

*Retirement
*Disability
*Family
*Survivors

Medicare

You have earned enough credits to qualify for benefits. At your current earnings rate, if you stop working and start receiving benefits...

At age 62, your payment would be about.............................................................. \$ 975 a month
If you continue working until..
your full retirement age ( 67 years), your payment would be about.
\$ 1,412 a month
age 70, your payment would be about.
\$ 1,761 a month
You have earned enough credits to qualify for benefits. If you became disabled right now, Your payment would be about.
\$ 1,293 a month

If you get retirement or disability benefits, your spouse and children also may qualify for benefits.

You have earned enough credits for your family to receive survivors benefits. If you die this year, certain members of your family may qualify for the following benefits.

Your child.................................................................................................... $\$ 1,008$ a month
Your spouse who is caring for your child............................................................ $\$ 1,008$ a month
Your spouse, if benefits start at full retirement age.
$\$ 1,344$ a month
Total family benefits cannot be more than
$\$ 2,473$ a month

Your spouse or minor child may be eligible for a special one-time death benefit of $\$ 255$.

You have enough credits to qualify for Medicare at age 65. Even if you do not retire at age 65, be sure to contact Social Security three months before your 65th birthday to enroll in Medicare.
*Your estimated benefits are based on current law. Congress has made changes to the law in the past and can do so at any time. The law governing benefit amounts may change because, by 2041 , the payroll taxes collected will be enough to pay only about 75 percent of scheduled benefits.

We based your benefit estimates on these facts:

Your estimated taxable earnings per year after 2006
\$38,626
Your Social Security number
(only the last four digits are shown to help prevent identity theft).
XXX-XX-1234

## Sample Statement Page 2

## Your Estimated Benefits

*Retirement You have earned enough credits to qualify for benefits. At your current earnings rate, if you stop working and start receiving benefits...

At age 62, your payment would be about........................................................ \$ 975 a month
If you continue working until...
your full retirement age ( 67 years), your payment would be about........................ \$ 1,412 a month
age 70, your payment would be about........................................................... \$ 1,761 a month

## Introduction

## Enter your information

Replace the example values with the numbers you want to use.

# Benefit Calculators 

## Break-Even Age

Updated October 24, 2005
At your break-even age, the accumulated value of higher benefits (from postponing retirement) will start to exceed the accumulated value of lower benefits (from choosing early retirement). To use this form, you will need benefit estimates, in today's dollars, for each age at which you may wish to retire. An excellent source for such estimates is your Social Security Statement.

Enter the earlier retirement age: 62 years and 11 month(s)
Enter the corresponding monthly benefit amount: \$900
Enter the later retirement age: $\sqrt{65}$ years and $\sqrt{10}$ month(s)
Enter the corresponding monthly benefit amount: \$ 1251

## Compute

## Estimated break-even age

Your estimated break-even age is
If you expect to live beyond this age, it would be to your advantage to delay your retirement.
Note: interest is not considered in the calculation.
If the calculation did not work for you, make sure Javascript is enabled for your browser.

- What do Americans believe about the returns to delayed claiming?
- How do the benefit rules impact retirement behavior?
- We designed a module of survey questions that elicits expectations of retirement and claiming behavior and of the returns to delayed claiming.
- The module is being administered to members of American Life Panel (ALP)


## American Life Panel

- RAND American Life Panel (ALP) is an Internet panel of over 1000 respondents age 18 and over
- recruited from among individuals age 18 and older who respond to the monthly University of Michigan Survey of Consumers.
- Respondents in the panel either use their own computer to log on to the Internet or use a Web TV
- For this survey module on Social Security claiming, we restrict the sample to respondents who are:
- younger than 60 years of age
- do not currently receive any income from Social Security payments
- perceive a positive probability of receiving Social Security benefits in the future.


## Measuring willingness to delay claiming

Suppose you [never work full time/ stop working full time at age $\boldsymbol{t}_{R}{ }^{*} /$ work full time for as long as you can, throughout your 60's and beyondl, and you have not yet begun to collect Social Security benefits as you are about to turn age $t_{c}{ }^{*}$

Suppose you must choose between starting to collect your benefits when you turn age $t_{c}{ }^{*}$ or when you turn age $t_{c}{ }^{*}+1$.
the is age at which R expents to beginclaiming Social Security benefits. in your 60's and beyond. Which of the following statements best describes your plans?

1. I will not be working full time at age 60 or later.
2. I will be working full time at age 60 or later, but I will completely stop working sometime after age 60.
3. I will be working full time at age 60 or later, but I will stop working full time sometime after age 60 and will likely continue working part time.
4. I will work full time for as long as I can, throughout my 60's and beyond. $\boldsymbol{t}_{R}{ }^{*}$ is expected retirement age: respondents who report that they will stop working full time are asked for the age at which they expect to stop working full time.

## Measuring willingness to delay claiming, cont.

If you choose to start to collect benefits at age $t_{c}{ }^{*}$, then you will receive $\$ b$ per month, and this amount will be guaranteed to increase annually based on a "cost-of-living adjustment" in order to keep up with inflation for the remainder of your lifetime.

If instead you choose to wait one year to start collecting benefits at age $\boldsymbol{t}_{\mathrm{C}}{ }^{*}+1$, then you will be guaranteed to receive an additional \$rb each month [-that is, an extra $\$ r b \times 12$ each year-] in today's dollars. This amount will be increased annually based on a "cost-of-living adjustment" in order to keep up with inflation for the remainder of your lifetime.
$b=1200,1800,2400$ depending on expected monthly benefit:
Suppose you [never work full time/ stop working full time at age $t_{R}{ }^{*} /$ work full time for as long as you can, throughout your 60's and beyond], and start collecting Social Security benefits at age $\boldsymbol{t}_{c}{ }^{*}$, about how much would you expect the payments to be in today's dollars.

$$
r=1 / 12,1 / 8,1 / 6, \text { and } 5 / 24
$$

## Information treatments

Treatment 1: If you expect to live beyond age $t_{c}{ }^{*}+(1 / r)$, then it would be to your advantage to delay your retirement (Note: interest is not included in this calculation).

Treatment 2: By choosing to wait, you would give up one year of benefits (that is, $b \times 12$ dollars) while you are age $t_{c}{ }^{*}$, but you would make up that amount in $1 / r$ years.

Treatment 3: If you expect to live beyond age $t_{C}{ }^{*}+(1 / r)$, then it would be to your advantage to delay your retirement (Note: interest is not included in this calculation). Moreover, you would continue to receive the extra rb $\times 12$ per year in the event that you live for many years after that.

Treatment 4: By choosing to wait, you would give up one year of benefits (that is, $b \times 12$ dollars) while you are age $t_{c}{ }^{*}$, but you would make up that amount in $1 / r$ years. Moreover, you would continue to receive the extra rb $\times 12$ per year in the event that you live for many years after that.

## Table 1: Descriptive Statistics

$$
\begin{array}{|ccc}
\text { Variable } & \mathrm{n} & \text { mean } \\
\hline \text { Age (years) } & 230 & 49 \\
\text { Gender (=1 if female) } & 228 & 0.37 \\
\text { Currently married or living with partner (=1 if yes) } & 228 & 0.69 \\
\text { Never married (=1 if yes) } & 228 & 0.13 \\
\hline
\end{array}
$$

Highest Educational Attainment
High School or Less ( $=1$ if yes)
Some College
Bachelor's Degree or More
Currently Employed ( $=1$ if yes)
DB pension on current job ( $=1$ if yes)
DC pension on current job ( $=1$ if yes)
Percent chance of living to age 70
230
230
230
0.30

Percent chance of living to age 80
230

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics
Time Preference: Today vs. 1 Year From Now (dollar value at which delays payment)

| $\$ 100(=1$ if yes) | 230 | 0.03 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 105$ | 230 | 0.09 |
| $\$ 110$ | 230 | 0.20 |
| $\$ 115$ | 230 | 0.10 |
| $\$ 120$ | 230 | 0.12 |
| $\$ 125$ | 230 | 0.10 |
| does not delay | 230 | 0.37 |

Time Preference: 10 vs. 11 Years From Now (dollar value at which delays payment)

| $\$ 100(=1$ if yes) | 230 | 0.03 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- |
| $\$ 105$ | 230 | 0.10 |
| $\$ 110$ | 230 | 0.19 |
| $\$ 115$ | 230 | 0.11 |
| $\$ 120$ | 230 | 0.19 |
| $\$ 125$ | 230 | 0.10 |
| does not delay | 230 | 0.29 |

## Table 1: Descriptive Statistics

Variable $n$ mean median std dev

## Retirement Plans

no full-time work at 60 or later ( $=1$ if yes)
$230 \quad 0.27$
completely stop working after 60
likely change to part-time after 60
230
0.13
full-time work "as long as I can" Expected retirement age (years)

230
0.29

Percent chance ever receive Social Security benefits
230
136
0.31

Source of Social Security Benefits own record ( $=1$ if yes) $230 \quad 0.67$ spouse's record $230 \quad 0.02$ both record $\quad 230 \quad 0.31$
Expected claiming age (years) $230 \quad 66.3$

Expected monthly benefits at claiming age (\$)
229
126
224
230
230
230
61.70
662
6.36
73.17

80 27.34

Expected monthly benefits if delay one year (\$)
Percent chance benefits keep up with inflation
Percent chance benefits cut substantially
$1348 \quad 1200$767
$29.7 \quad 25$ 26.55

## RAND

Table 2: Percent Chance of Delayed Claiming

| Delayed Claiming <br> Scenario |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Sample | n | mean | median |
| Percent Chance | Treatment 1 | 230 | 59.1 | 60 |
| With Return Of | Treatment 2 | 62 | 40.6 | 80 |
| $1 / 12$ | Treatment 3 | 63 | 67.6 | 75 |
|  | Treatment 4 | 58 | 59.6 | 60 |
|  | Full Sample | 211 | 69.1 | 75 |
| Percent Chance | Treatment 1 | 44 | 80.0 | 80 |
| With Return Of 1/8 | Treatment 2 | 51 | 53.2 | 50 |
|  | Treatment 3 | 62 | 71.5 | 75 |
|  | Treatment 4 | 54 | 72.5 | 75 |
|  | Full Sample | 210 | 75.4 | 80 |
| Percent Chance | Treatment 1 | 44 | 84.2 | 90 |
| With Return Of 1/6 | Treatment 2 | 50 | 62.7 | 65 |
|  | Treatment 3 | 62 | 75.0 | 80 |
|  | Treatment 4 | 54 | 80.3 | 85 |
|  | Full Sample | 209 | 79.0 | 90 |
| Percent Chance | Treatment 1 | 44 | 85.6 | 99 |
| With Return Of | Treatment 2 | 50 | 70.1 | 75 |
| 5/24 | Treatment 3 | 61 | 78.2 | 90 |
|  | Treatment 4 | 54 | 82.8 | 90 |

## Expectations of Delayed Claiming Returns and Choices

- Delayed claiming scenarios we pose tend to be very attractive relative to expected benefits and returns to delayed claiming
- Median expected benefit = lowest value for b
- High probabilities that real benefits will decline
- Low expected increase in benefits for one-year delay
- Mean=7.5\% (\$85), median=4.2\% (\$50)
- One-third report no increase
- Expected retirement age $t_{R}{ }^{*}$ vs. claiming age $t_{C}{ }^{*}$
- For $\boldsymbol{t}_{R}{ }^{*}<62,64 \%$ report $\boldsymbol{t}_{C}{ }^{*}>\mathbf{6 2}$
- For $t_{R}{ }^{*} \geq 62,71 \%$ report $t_{C}{ }^{*}=t_{R}{ }^{*}$


## Predictors of Delayed Claiming

| Excerpt from Table 4: Best Linear Predictors of Delayed Claiming Expectations |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Predictor Variable | Percent Chance of Delayed Claiming with Return $\mathrm{r}_{1}=1 / 12$ |
| Expected change in benefits if delay one year (fraction) | $\begin{aligned} & -15.501 \\ & (16.468) \end{aligned}$ |
| Percent chance benefits keep up with inflation | $\begin{gathered} 0.074 \\ (0.079) \end{gathered}$ |
| Percent chance benefits cut substantially | $\begin{gathered} 0.139 \\ (0.082) \end{gathered}$ |
| Percent chance of living to age 80 | $\begin{gathered} 0.253 \\ (0.097) \end{gathered}$ |
| Requires at least $0 \%-5 \%$ return to delay payment to 11 years from now | $\begin{aligned} & 12.927 \\ & (8.976) \end{aligned}$ |
| Requires at least $10 \%-15 \%$ return to delay payment to 11 years from now | $\begin{gathered} 3.353 \\ (6.031) \end{gathered}$ |
| Requires at least $20 \%-25 \%$ return to delay payment to 11 years from now | $\begin{aligned} & 13.763 \\ & (5.441) \end{aligned}$ |
| N | 222 |

Excerpt from Table 4: Best Linear Predictors of Delayed Claiming Expectations Percent Chance of Delayed Claiming

## Predictor Variable

 Information treatment 2Information treatment 3

Information treatment 4
with Return $\mathrm{r}_{1}=1 / 12$
-30.474
(6.831)
-5.993
(5.913)
-14.045
(6.218)

222 reported in parentheses

## Future Directions

- Ongoing data collection will increase sample size
- Will be able to estimate structural models of labor force participation and benefit claiming decisions
- Use data from other waves of the ALP
- Access to information on household wealth, financial literacy, other reports of Social Security benefits and claiming age expectations
- Conduct supplemental analysis of HRS data
- SS benefits and claiming age expectations data
- Data on realizations as well

